

PROJECT: 2017 Pavement Resurfacing Program

OWNER: City of Hubbard

PROJECT NO.: 160714

SORTED BY BASE BID

BIDDER	BASE BID	BASE & ALT A	BASE & ALT B	BASE & ALT A & B
Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	120,474.73	129,486.51	130,027.59	139,039.37
R.T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	121,209.35	128,200.45	129,735.05	136,726.15
Shelly & Sands, Inc.	133,055.65	142,669.65	143,667.65	153,281.65
Americon Industrial Services	136,107.62	143,857.46	145,418.24	153,168.08
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc.	141,462.20	149,712.90	151,909.60	160,160.30
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	141,790.00	151,378.00	154,560.00	164,148.00

ALTERNATES

	ALT A Belle Vista	ALT B Saul
Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	9,011.78	9,552.86
R.T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	6,991.10	8,525.70
Shelly & Sands, Inc.	9,614.00	10,612.00
Americon Industrial Services	7,749.84	9,310.62
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc.	8,250.70	10,447.40
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	9,588.00	12,770.00

2017 Pavement Resurfacing Program
City of Hubbard
Bid Opening Date: May 17, 2017
Bid Tabulation Summary
Base Bid
Project No. 160714

LIST OF BIDDERS

BIDDER

- 1 Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.
4862 West State Street
P.O. Box 272
Hillsville, PA 16132
Phone number: (724) 546-6680

- 2 R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.
11299 South Avenue Extension
North Lima, OH 44452
Phone number: (330) 549-2852

- 3 Shelly & Sands, Inc.
720 Home Ave.
Akron, OH 443104191
Phone number: (330) 253-3612

- 4 Americon Industrial Services
3651 Leharps Road
Youngstown, OH 44515
Phone number: (330) 953-2565

- 5 Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A
124 Darrow Road
Akron, OH 44305
Phone number: (330) 733-9101

- 6 Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.
17290 Munn Rd.
Chagrin Falls, OH 44023
Phone number: (440) 543-2253

2017 Pavement Resurfacing Program
City of Hubbard
Bid Opening Date: May 17, 2017
Bid Tabulation Summary
Base Bid
Project No. 160714

LIST OF TOTALS

NOTE: Bidders Informal Totals appear if different than bid tab calculated total.

	<u>Name</u>	<u>Calculated Total</u>	<u>Bidder's Informal Totals</u>
1.	Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	\$120,474.73	
2.	R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	\$121,209.35	
3.	Shelly & Sands, Inc.	\$133,055.65	
4.	Americon Industrial Services	\$136,107.62	\$136,161.64
5.	Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$141,462.20	
6.	Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$141,790.00	

2017 Pavement Resurfacing Program
 City of Hubbard
 Bid Opening Date: May 17, 2017
 Bid Tabulation Summary
 Base Bid
 Project No. 160714

LIST OF ALL ITEMS
NOTE: Bidders Informal unit price or item total appear if different than bid tab calculated price.

Bidders	Labor	Material	Calculated		Bidder's Informal		Bidder's Informal Line Item Total
			Unit Price	Line Item Total	Unit Price	Line Item Total	
1. 13,359.00 SY OF (254) PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE, AS PER PLAN							
Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	\$1.97	\$0.00	\$1.97	\$26,317.23			
R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	\$0.57	\$1.08	\$1.65	\$22,042.35			
Shelly & Sands, Inc.	\$2.35	\$0.00	\$2.35	\$31,393.65			
American Industrial Services	\$1.50	\$0.68	\$2.18	\$29,122.62			
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$1.30	\$0.50	\$1.80	\$24,046.20			\$29,183.64
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$2.00	\$0.00	\$2.00	\$26,718.00			
2. 1,336.00 GAL OF (407) TACK COAT							
Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	\$0.35	\$1.65	\$2.00	\$2,672.00			
R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	\$0.15	\$1.85	\$2.00	\$2,672.00			
Shelly & Sands, Inc.	\$0.00	\$2.00	\$2.00	\$2,672.00			
American Industrial Services	\$1.00	\$1.00	\$2.00	\$3,006.00			
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$1.00	\$1.25	\$2.25	\$2,672.00			
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$1.00	\$1.00	\$2.00	\$2,672.00			
3. 557.00 CY OF (441) ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG64-22, AS PER PLAN							
Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	\$41.50	\$100.00	\$141.50	\$78,815.50			
R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	\$20.00	\$115.00	\$135.00	\$75,195.00			
Shelly & Sands, Inc.	\$10.00	\$140.00	\$150.00	\$83,550.00			
American Industrial Services	\$49.00	\$100.00	\$149.00	\$82,993.00			
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$36.41	\$133.59	\$170.00	\$94,690.00			
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$25.00	\$125.00	\$150.00	\$83,550.00			
4. 19.00 EACH OF (611) CATCH BASIN ADJUSTED TO GRADE							
Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	\$175.00	\$100.00	\$275.00	\$5,225.00			
R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	\$250.00	\$300.00	\$550.00	\$10,450.00			
Shelly & Sands, Inc.	\$200.00	\$200.00	\$400.00	\$7,600.00			
American Industrial Services	\$300.00	\$240.00	\$540.00	\$10,260.00			
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$530.88	\$69.12	\$600.00	\$11,400.00			
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$250.00	\$500.00	\$750.00	\$14,250.00			

2017 Pavement Resurfacing Program
 City of Hubbard
 Bid Opening Date: May 17, 2017
 Bid Tabulation Summary
 Base Bid
 Project No. 160714

LIST OF ALL ITEMS

NOTE: Bidders Informal unit price or item total appear if different than bid tab calculated price.

Bidders	Labor	Material	Calculated Unit Price	Bidder's Informal Unit Price	Calculated Line Item Total	Bidder's Informal Line Item Total
5. 19.00 EACH OF (611) MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE						
Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	\$250.00	\$125.00	\$375.00		\$7,125.00	
R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	\$200.00	\$350.00	\$550.00		\$10,450.00	
Shelly & Sands, Inc.	\$200.00	\$200.00	\$400.00		\$7,600.00	
Americon Industrial Services	\$300.00	\$240.00	\$540.00		\$10,260.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$340.83	\$59.17	\$400.00		\$7,600.00	
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$100.00	\$500.00	\$600.00		\$11,400.00	
6. 8.00 EACH OF (638) VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE						
Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	\$10.00	\$30.00	\$40.00		\$320.00	
R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	\$20.00	\$30.00	\$50.00		\$400.00	
Shelly & Sands, Inc.	\$10.00	\$20.00	\$30.00		\$240.00	
Americon Industrial Services	\$50.00	\$50.00	\$100.00		\$800.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$44.73	\$45.27	\$90.00		\$720.00	
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$100.00	\$300.00	\$400.00		\$3,200.00	

2017 Pavement Resurfacing Program
City of Hubbard
Bid Opening Date: May 17, 2017
Bid Tabulation Summary
Alternate A - Belle Vista
Project No. 160714

LIST OF BIDDERS

BIDDER

- 1 R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.
11299 South Avenue Extension
North Lima, OH 44452
Phone number: (330) 549-2852

- 2 Americon Industrial Services
3651 Leharps Road
Youngstown, OH 44515
Phone number: (330) 953-2565

- 3 Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A
124 Darrow Road
Akron, OH 44305
Phone number: (330) 733-9101

- 4 Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.
4862 West State Street
P.O. Box 272
Hillsville, PA 16132
Phone number: (724) 546-6680

- 5 Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.
17290 Munn Rd.
Chagrin Falls, OH 44023
Phone number: (440) 543-2253

- 6 Shelly & Sands, Inc.
720 Home Ave.
Akron, OH 443104191
Phone number: (330) 253-3612

2017 Pavement Resurfacing Program
City of Hubbard
Bid Opening Date: May 17, 2017
Bid Tabulation Summary
Alternate A - Belle Vista
Project No. 160714

LIST OF TOTALS

NOTE: Bidders Informal Totals appear if different than bid tab calculated total.

	<u>Name</u>	<u>Calculated Total</u>	<u>Bidder's Informal Totals</u>
1.	R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	\$6,991.10	
2.	Americon Industrial Services	\$7,749.84	
3.	Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$8,250.70	
4.	Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	\$9,011.78	
5.	Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$9,588.00	
6.	Shelly & Sands, Inc.	\$9,614.00	

2017 Pavement Resurfacing Program
 City of Hubbard
 Bid Opening Date: May 17, 2017
 Bid Tabulation Summary
 Alternate A - Belle Vista
 Project No. 160714

LIST OF ALL ITEMS

NOTE: Bidders Informal unit price or item total appear if different than bid tab calculated price.

Bidders	Labor	Material	Calculated		Bidder's Informal		Calculated		Bidder's Informal	
			Unit Price	Line Item Total	Unit Price	Line Item Total	Unit Price	Line Item Total		
1. 854.00 SY OF PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE, AS PER PLAN										
R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	\$0.57	\$1.08		\$1.65			\$1,409.10			
American Industrial Services	\$1.50	\$0.46		\$1.96			\$1,673.84			
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$1.38	\$0.42		\$1.80			\$1,537.20			
Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	\$1.97	\$0.00		\$1.97			\$1,682.38			
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$4.00	\$0.00		\$4.00			\$3,416.00			
Shelly & Sands, Inc.	\$3.00	\$0.00		\$3.00			\$2,562.00			
2. 86.00 GAL OF TACK COAT										
R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	\$0.15	\$1.85		\$2.00			\$172.00			
American Industrial Services	\$1.00	\$1.00		\$2.00			\$172.00			
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$1.00	\$1.25		\$2.25			\$193.50			
Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	\$0.35	\$1.65		\$2.00			\$172.00			
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$1.00	\$1.00		\$2.00			\$172.00			
Shelly & Sands, Inc.	\$0.00	\$2.00		\$2.00			\$172.00			
3. 36.00 CY OF ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG64-22, AS PER PLAN										
R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	\$20.00	\$115.00		\$135.00			\$4,860.00			
American Industrial Services	\$49.00	\$100.00		\$149.00			\$5,364.00			
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$47.51	\$122.49		\$170.00			\$6,120.00			
Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	\$88.40	\$100.00		\$188.40			\$6,782.40			
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$25.00	\$125.00		\$150.00			\$5,400.00			
Shelly & Sands, Inc.	\$40.00	\$140.00		\$180.00			\$6,480.00			
4. 1.00 EACH OF MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE										
R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	\$200.00	\$350.00		\$550.00			\$550.00			
American Industrial Services	\$300.00	\$240.00		\$540.00			\$540.00			
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$340.83	\$59.17		\$400.00			\$400.00			
Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	\$250.00	\$125.00		\$375.00			\$375.00			
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$100.00	\$500.00		\$600.00			\$600.00			
Shelly & Sands, Inc.	\$200.00	\$200.00		\$400.00			\$400.00			

2017 Pavement Resurfacing Program
City of Hubbard
Bid Opening Date: May 17, 2017
Bid Tabulation Summary
Alternate B - Saul
Project No. 160714

LIST OF BIDDERS

BIDDER

- 1 R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.
11299 South Avenue Extension
North Lima, OH 44452
Phone number: (330) 549-2852

- 2 Americon Industrial Services
3651 Leharps Road
Youngstown, OH 44515
Phone number: (330) 953-2565

- 3 Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.
4862 West State Street
P.O. Box 272
Hillsville, PA 16132
Phone number: (724) 546-6680

- 4 Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A
124 Darrow Road
Akron, OH 44305
Phone number: (330) 733-9101

- 5 Shelly & Sands, Inc.
720 Home Ave.
Akron, OH 443104191
Phone number: (330) 253-3612

- 6 Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.
17290 Munn Rd.
Chagrin Falls, OH 44023
Phone number: (440) 543-2253

2017 Pavement Resurfacing Program
City of Hubbard
Bid Opening Date: May 17, 2017
Bid Tabulation Summary
Alternate B - Saul
Project No. 160714

LIST OF TOTALS

NOTE: Bidders Informal Totals appear if different than bid tab calculated total.

	<u>Name</u>	<u>Calculated Total</u>	<u>Bidder's Informal Totals</u>
1.	R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	\$8,525.70	
2.	Americon Industrial Services	\$9,310.62	\$9,285.48
3.	Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	\$9,552.86	
4.	Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$10,447.40	
5.	Shelly & Sands, Inc.	\$10,612.00	
6.	Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$12,770.00	

LIST OF ALL ITEMS

NOTE: Bidders Informal unit price or item total appear if different than bid tab calculated price.

Bidders	Labor	Material	Calculated Unit Price	Bidders' Informal		Calculated	
				Unit Price	Line Item Total	Line Item Total	Bidder's Informal Line Item Total
1. 838.00 SY OF PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE, AS PER PLAN							
R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	\$0.57	\$1.08	\$1.65			\$1,382.70	
American Industrial Services	\$1.50	\$0.49	\$1.99			\$1,667.62	
Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	\$1.97	\$0.00	\$1.97	\$1.96		\$1,650.86	\$1,642.48
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$1.39	\$0.41	\$1.80			\$1,508.40	
Shelly & Sands, Inc.	\$3.00	\$0.00	\$3.00			\$2,514.00	
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$4.00	\$0.00	\$4.00			\$3,352.00	
2. 84.00 GAL OF TACK COAT							
R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	\$0.15	\$1.85	\$2.00			\$168.00	
American Industrial Services	\$1.00	\$1.00	\$2.00			\$168.00	
Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	\$0.35	\$1.65	\$2.00			\$168.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$1.00	\$1.25	\$2.25			\$189.00	
Shelly & Sands, Inc.	\$0.00	\$2.00	\$2.00			\$168.00	
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$1.00	\$1.00	\$2.00			\$168.00	
3. 35.00 CY OF ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG64-22, AS PER PLAN							
R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	\$20.00	\$115.00	\$135.00			\$4,725.00	
American Industrial Services	\$49.00	\$100.00	\$149.00			\$5,215.00	
Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	\$88.40	\$100.00	\$188.40			\$6,594.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$48.45	\$121.55	\$170.00			\$5,950.00	
Shelly & Sands, Inc.	\$40.00	\$140.00	\$180.00			\$6,300.00	
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$25.00	\$125.00	\$150.00			\$5,250.00	
4. 4.00 EACH OF CATCH BASIN ADJUSTED TO GRADE							
R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	\$250.00	\$300.00	\$550.00			\$2,200.00	
American Industrial Services	\$300.00	\$240.00	\$540.00			\$2,160.00	
Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	\$175.00	\$100.00	\$275.00			\$1,100.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$530.88	\$69.12	\$600.00			\$2,400.00	
Shelly & Sands, Inc.	\$200.00	\$200.00	\$400.00			\$1,600.00	
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$200.00	\$700.00	\$900.00			\$3,600.00	

2017 Pavement Resurfacing Program
 City of Hubbard
 Bid Opening Date: May 17, 2017
 Bid Tabulation Summary
 Alternate B - Saul
 Project No. 160714

LIST OF ALL ITEMS

NOTE: Bidders Informal unit price or item total appear if different than bid tab calculated price.

Bidders	Labor	Material	Calculated Unit Price	Bidder's Informal Unit Price	Calculated Line Item Total	Bidder's Informal Line Item Total
5. 1.00 EACH OF VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE						
R. T. Vernal Paving, Inc.	\$20.00	\$30.00	\$50.00		\$50.00	
American Industrial Services	\$50.00	\$50.00	\$100.00		\$100.00	
Butch & McCree Paving, Inc.	\$10.00	\$30.00	\$40.00		\$40.00	
Barbicas Construction Co., Inc. A	\$340.83	\$59.17	\$400.00		\$400.00	
Shelly & Sands, Inc.	\$10.00	\$20.00	\$30.00		\$30.00	
Chaerlin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$100.00	\$300.00	\$400.00		\$400.00	