

October 18, 2012

Mr. Anthony Hatmaker
Treasurer
City of North Ridgeville
7307 Avon Belden Road
North Ridgeville, Ohio 44039

**Re: Senior Center ADA Renovations and Parking Lot Resurfacing Improvements
Bid Results**

Dear Mr. Hatmaker:

Bids were received for the above referenced project on October 17, 2012, and attached you will find a copy of the Bid Tabulation outlining each bid for your review.

The low bidder for **Contract A – Parking Lot Resurfacing** is Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc. of Chagrin Falls, Ohio, whose bid has been reviewed and found to be in conformance with all contract requirements. It is our opinion that they are experienced and qualified to perform the work within the contract.

The low bidder for **Contract B – ADA Renovations** is J.A. Kilby Enterprises of North Ridgeville, Ohio, whose bid has been reviewed and found to be in conformance with all contract requirements. It is our opinion that they are experienced and qualified to perform the work within the contract.

Should you have any questions or require additional information, please feel free to contact our office.

Respectfully,

CT CONSULTANTS, INC.



Peter J. Formica, P.E.
Project Engineer

PJF/saa

Enclosures

H:\2012\12335\SPEC\Bid Results Letter.Docx

Senior Center Improvements
City of North Ridgeville
Bid Opening Date: October 17, 2012
Bid Tabulation Summary
Contract A - Parking Lot Resurfacing
Project No. 12335

LIST OF BIDDERS

BIDDER

- 1 Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.
17290 Munn Rd.
Chagrin Falls, OH 44023
Phone number: (440) 543-2253
- 2 Infinity Paving Company, Inc.
2248 Lost Nation Road, Unit A
Willoughby, OH 44094
Phone number: (440) 946-6960
- 3 Carron Asphalt Paving, Inc.
7615 Bond St.
Solon, OH 44139
Phone number: (440) 439-6464
- 4 Cross Roads Asphalt Recycling, Inc.
13421 Hawke Rd.
Columbia Station, OH 44028
Phone number: (440) 236-5066
- 5 North Coast Paving Co.
2417 Woodhill Rd.
Cleveland, OH 44104
Phone number: (216) 421-1203
- 6 Burton Scot Contractors LLC
11330 Kinsman Road
Newbury, OH 44065
Phone number: (440) 564-1011
- 7 D. D. Mitchell Construction, LLC*
5129 North Ridge Road
550 (Painesville, OH 44077-055
Perry, OH 44081
Phone number: (440) 357-1840
- 8 Karvo Paving Co.
4524 Hudson Drive
Stow, OH 44224
Phone number: (330) 929-9616

Senior Center Improvements
City of North Ridgeville
Bid Opening Date: October 17, 2012
Bid Tabulation Summary
Contract A - Parking Lot Resurfacing
Project No. 12335

LIST OF TOTALS

NOTE: Bidders Informal Totals appear if different than bid tab calculated total.

	<u>Name</u>	<u>Calculated Total</u>	<u>Bidder's Informal Totals</u>
1.	Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$37,320.00	
2.	Infinity Paving Company, Inc.	\$38,764.00	
3.	Carron Asphalt Paving, Inc.	\$38,985.00	
4.	Cross Roads Asphalt Recycling, Inc.	\$39,080.00	
5.	North Coast Paving Co.	\$39,390.00	
6.	Burton Scot Contractors LLC	\$39,999.00	
7.	D. D. Mitchell Construction, LLC*	\$41,407.00	
8.	Karvo Paving Co.	\$44,720.00	

Senior Center Improvements
City of North Ridgeville
Bid Opening Date: October 17, 2012
Bid Tabulation Summary
Contract A - Parking Lot Resurfacing
Project No. 12335

LIST OF ALL ITEMS

NOTE: Bidders Informal unit price or item total appear if different than bid tab calculated price.

<u>Bidders</u>	<u>Labor</u>	<u>Material</u>	<u>Calculated Unit Price</u>	<u>Bidder's Informal Unit Price</u>	<u>Calculated Line Item Total</u>	<u>Bidder's Informal Line Item Total</u>
1. 18.00 CU YD OF (SPC) UNDERCUT AND BACKFILL UNSUITABLE SUBGRADE, AS PER PLAN, CONTINGENCY, AS DIRECTED						
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$25.00	\$50.00	\$75.00		\$1,350.00	
Infinity Paving Company, Inc.	\$30.00	\$20.00	\$50.00		\$900.00	
Carron Asphalt Paving, Inc.	\$25.00	\$50.00	\$75.00		\$1,350.00	
Cross Roads Asphalt Recycling, Inc.	\$60.00	\$40.00	\$100.00		\$1,800.00	
North Coast Paving Co.	\$40.00	\$25.00	\$65.00		\$1,170.00	
Burton Scot Contractors LLC	\$15.00	\$15.00	\$30.00		\$540.00	
D. D. Mitchell Construction, LLC*	\$75.00	\$50.00	\$125.00		\$2,250.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$25.00	\$25.00	\$50.00		\$900.00	
2. 2,200.00 SQ YD OF (254) PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$2.75	\$0.00	\$2.75		\$6,050.00	
Infinity Paving Company, Inc.	\$3.27	\$0.00	\$3.27		\$7,194.00	
Carron Asphalt Paving, Inc.	\$3.60	\$0.00	\$3.60		\$7,920.00	
Cross Roads Asphalt Recycling, Inc.	\$3.15	\$0.00	\$3.15		\$6,930.00	
North Coast Paving Co.	\$3.50	\$0.00	\$3.50		\$7,700.00	
Burton Scot Contractors LLC	\$4.00	\$1.75	\$5.75		\$12,650.00	
D. D. Mitchell Construction, LLC*	\$5.00	\$0.00	\$5.00		\$11,000.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$2.57	\$3.13	\$5.70		\$12,540.00	
3. 18.00 CU YD OF (301) BITUMINOUS AGGREGATE BASE, PG64-22, INCLUDING EXCAVATION, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$25.00	\$200.00	\$225.00		\$4,050.00	
Infinity Paving Company, Inc.	\$130.00	\$100.00	\$230.00		\$4,140.00	
Carron Asphalt Paving, Inc.	\$80.00	\$100.00	\$180.00		\$3,240.00	
Cross Roads Asphalt Recycling, Inc.	\$45.00	\$100.00	\$145.00		\$2,610.00	
North Coast Paving Co.	\$85.00	\$100.00	\$185.00		\$3,330.00	
Burton Scot Contractors LLC	\$40.00	\$58.00	\$98.00		\$1,764.00	
D. D. Mitchell Construction, LLC*	\$64.00	\$148.00	\$212.00		\$3,816.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$72.00	\$88.00	\$160.00		\$2,880.00	

Senior Center Improvements
City of North Ridgeville
Bid Opening Date: October 17, 2012
Bid Tabulation Summary
Contract A - Parking Lot Resurfacing
Project No. 12335

LIST OF ALL ITEMS

NOTE: Bidders Informal unit price or item total appear if different than bid tab calculated price.

<u>Bidders</u>	<u>Labor</u>	<u>Material</u>	<u>Calculated Unit Price</u>	<u>Bidder's Informal Unit Price</u>	<u>Calculated Line Item Total</u>	<u>Bidder's Informal Line Item Total</u>
4. 330.00 GALLON OF (407) TACK COAT, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$1.00	\$2.00	\$3.00		\$990.00	
Infinity Paving Company, Inc.	\$1.00	\$2.00	\$3.00		\$990.00	
Carron Asphalt Paving, Inc.	\$0.50	\$2.50	\$3.00		\$990.00	
Cross Roads Asphalt Recycling, Inc.	\$0.25	\$1.75	\$2.00		\$660.00	
North Coast Paving Co.	\$1.50	\$2.50	\$4.00		\$1,320.00	
Burton Scot Contractors LLC	\$1.00	\$2.00	\$3.00		\$990.00	
D. D. Mitchell Construction, LLC*	\$1.00	\$2.70	\$3.70		\$1,221.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$1.00	\$1.00	\$2.00		\$660.00	
5. 110.00 CU YD OF (448) ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, PG64-22, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$32.00	\$175.00	\$207.00		\$22,770.00	
Infinity Paving Company, Inc.	\$80.00	\$133.00	\$213.00		\$23,430.00	
Carron Asphalt Paving, Inc.	\$82.75	\$130.00	\$212.75		\$23,402.50	
Cross Roads Asphalt Recycling, Inc.	\$85.00	\$140.00	\$225.00		\$24,750.00	
North Coast Paving Co.	\$85.00	\$130.00	\$215.00		\$23,650.00	
Burton Scot Contractors LLC	\$75.00	\$125.00	\$200.00		\$22,000.00	
D. D. Mitchell Construction, LLC*	\$60.00	\$125.00	\$185.00		\$20,350.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$104.63	\$127.87	\$232.50		\$25,575.00	
6. 110.00 SQ YD OF (690) GEOTEXTILE FABRIC, 712.09 TYPE D						
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$0.50	\$0.50	\$1.00		\$110.00	
Infinity Paving Company, Inc.	\$0.50	\$0.50	\$1.00		\$110.00	
Carron Asphalt Paving, Inc.	\$0.15	\$0.60	\$0.75		\$82.50	
Cross Roads Asphalt Recycling, Inc.	\$1.00	\$2.00	\$3.00		\$330.00	
North Coast Paving Co.	\$1.00	\$1.00	\$2.00		\$220.00	
Burton Scot Contractors LLC	\$0.10	\$0.40	\$0.50		\$55.00	
D. D. Mitchell Construction, LLC*	\$3.00	\$4.00	\$7.00		\$770.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.68	\$0.82	\$1.50		\$165.00	

Senior Center Improvements
City of North Ridgeville
Bid Opening Date: October 17, 2012
Bid Tabulation Summary
Contract A - Parking Lot Resurfacing
Project No. 12335

LIST OF ALL ITEMS

NOTE: Bidders Informal unit price or item total appear if different than bid tab calculated price.

<u>Bidders</u>	<u>Labor</u>	<u>Material</u>	<u>Calculated Unit Price</u>	<u>Bidder's Informal Unit Price</u>	<u>Calculated Line Item Total</u>	<u>Bidder's Informal Line Item Total</u>
7. 1.00 LUMP OF (SPC) CONTINGENCY/DISCRETIONARY ALLOWANCE						
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$0.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00		\$2,000.00	
Infinity Paving Company, Inc.	\$0.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00		\$2,000.00	
Carron Asphalt Paving, Inc.	\$0.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00		\$2,000.00	
Cross Roads Asphalt Recycling, Inc.	\$0.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00		\$2,000.00	
North Coast Paving Co.	\$0.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00		\$2,000.00	
Burton Scot Contractors LLC	\$0.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00		\$2,000.00	
D. D. Mitchell Construction, LLC*	\$0.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00		\$2,000.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00		\$2,000.00	

**BID TABULATION
FOR SENIOR CENTER IMPROVEMENTS
CONTRACT B: ADA RENOVATIONS
PROJECT NO. 12335**

REF NO.	DOOR AND WINDOW REPLACEMENT, AS PER PLAN	QTY.	MEASURE UNIT	LABOR	MATERIAL	TOTAL
1.	J.A. KILBY ENTERPRISES	1.00	LUMP	\$9,934.00	\$ 9,934.00	\$19,868.00
2.	S.M. FOX CONSTRUCTION, INC.	1.00	LUMP	\$6,000.00	\$18,300.00	\$24,300.00

J.A. Kilby Enterprises
P. O. Box 39067
North Ridgeville, Ohio 44039
PH: 440.327.3433
FAX: 440.774.3433

S.M. Fox Construction, Inc.
9632 Patricia Court
Elyria, Ohio 44035
PH: 440.323.5776
FAX: 440.323.7229

NOTICE OF AWARD

TO: Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.
17290 Munn Road
Chagrin Falls, Ohio 44023

PROJECT: SENIOR CENTER IMPROVEMENTS - CONTRACT A - PARKING LOT
RESURFACING

You are notified that your Bid which was opened on 10/17/12 has been accepted for items in the amount of \$37,320.00.

You are required by the Instructions to Bidders to execute the Agreement and furnish the required Bonds, Certificates of Insurance, and other documents within 10 calendar days from the date of receipt of this Notice.

Failure to comply with these conditions within the time specified will entitle Owner to consider your Bid in default, to annul this Notice and to declare your Bid Security forfeited.

The Owner will return to you one (1) fully signed set of the contract documents.

CITY OF NORTH RIDGEVILLE

G. David Gillock, Mayor

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

CHAGRIN VALLEY PAVING, INC.

Paul A. Phillips, President

Date

NOTICE OF AWARD

TO: J.A. Kilby Enterprises
P.O. Box 39067
North Ridgeville, Ohio 44039

PROJECT: SENIOR CENTER IMPROVEMENTS - CONTRACT B - ADA RENOVATIONS

You are notified that your Bid which was opened on 10/17/12 has been accepted for items in the amount of \$19,868.00.

You are required by the Instructions to Bidders to execute the Agreement and furnish the required Bonds, Certificates of Insurance, and other documents within 10 calendar days from the date of receipt of this Notice.

Failure to comply with these conditions within the time specified will entitle Owner to consider your Bid in default, to annul this Notice and to declare your Bid Security forfeited.

The Owner will return to you one (1) fully signed set of the contract documents.

CITY OF NORTH RIDGEVILLE

G. David Gillock, Mayor

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

CHAGRIN VALLEY PAVING, INC.

Paul A. Phillips, President

Date