

2012 Pavement Repair Program
City of Willoughby
Bid Opening Date: May 17, 2012
Bid Tabulation Summary

Project No. 12135

LIST OF BIDDERS

BIDDER

- 1 Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.
17290 Munn Rd.
Chagrin Falls, OH 44023
Phone number: (440) 543-2253

- 2 Ronyak Paving, Inc.
14376 N. Cheshire St.
567
Burton, OH 44021
Phone number: (440) 834-1988

- 3 Karvo Paving Co.
4524 Hudson Drive
Stow, OH 44224
Phone number: (330) 929-9616

- 4 Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division
8920 Canyon Falls Blvd., #120
Twinsburg, OH 44087
Phone number: (330) 425-7861

2012 Pavement Repair Program
City of Willoughby
Bid Opening Date: May 17, 2012
Bid Tabulation Summary

Project No. 12135

LIST OF TOTALS

NOTE: Bidders Informal Totals appear if different than bid tab calculated total.

<u>Name</u>	<u>Calculated Total</u>	<u>Bidder's Informal Totals</u>
1. Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$1,034,720.00	
2. Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$1,035,883.35	
3. Karvo Paving Co.	\$1,085,314.85	
4. Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$1,214,726.18	

2012 Pavement Repair Program
 City of Willoughby
 Bid Opening Date: May 17, 2012
 Bid Tabulation Summary

Project No. 12135

LIST OF ALL ITEMS
 NOTE: Bidders Informal unit price or item total appear if different than bid tab calculated price.

Bidders	Labor	Material	Calculated Unit Price	Bidder's Informal Unit Price	Calculated Line Item Total	Bidder's Informal Line Item Total
1. 1.00 LUMP OF (SPC) BONDS AND INSURANCES, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$0.00	\$8,500.00	\$8,500.00		\$8,500.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$0.00	\$9,100.00	\$9,100.00		\$9,100.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.00	\$8,500.00	\$8,500.00		\$8,500.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$6,000.00	\$0.00	\$6,000.00		\$6,000.00	
2. 1,975.00 SQ YD OF (251) PARTIAL DEPTH PAVEMENT REPAIR, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$4.00	\$8.00	\$12.00		\$23,700.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$10.00	\$6.00	\$16.00		\$31,600.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$6.04	\$7.96	\$14.00		\$27,650.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$11.20	\$16.80	\$28.00		\$55,300.00	
3. 670.00 SQ YD OF (251) PARTIAL DEPTH PAVEMENT JOINT REPAIR, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$10.00	\$20.00	\$30.00		\$20,100.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$26.00	\$12.00	\$38.00		\$25,460.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$23.44	\$16.56	\$40.00		\$26,800.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$22.80	\$34.20	\$57.00		\$38,190.00	
4. 20.00 SQ YD OF (252) FULL DEPTH RIGID PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND FLEXIBLE REPLACEMENT, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$37.00	\$100.00	\$137.00		\$2,740.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$60.00	\$20.00	\$80.00		\$1,600.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$21.17	\$26.83	\$48.00		\$960.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$150.00	\$225.00	\$375.00		\$7,500.00	
5. 122.00 CU YD OF (253) PAVEMENT REPAIR, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$70.00	\$200.00	\$270.00		\$32,940.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$120.00	\$80.00	\$200.00		\$24,400.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$125.75	\$159.25	\$285.00		\$34,770.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$164.00	\$246.00	\$410.00		\$50,020.00	
6. 38,832.00 SQ YD OF (254) PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE, VARIABLE THICKNESS, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$1.85	\$0.00	\$1.85		\$71,839.20	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$1.40	\$0.00	\$1.40		\$54,364.80	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.28	\$1.47	\$1.75		\$67,956.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$1.95	\$0.00	\$1.95		\$75,722.40	

2012 Pavement Repair Program
 City of Willoughby
 Bid Opening Date: May 17, 2012
 Bid Tabulation Summary

Project No. 12135

LIST OF ALL ITEMS
 NOTE: Bidders Informal unit price or item total appear if different than bid tab calculated price.

Bidders	Labor	Material	Calculated Unit Price	Bidder's Informal Unit Price	Calculated Line Item Total	Bidder's Informal Line Item Total
7. 1,260.00 SQ YD OF (254) PAVEMENT PLANING, PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$1.85	\$0.00	\$1.85		\$2,331.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$5.00	\$0.00	\$5.00		\$6,300.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$1.70	\$7.05	\$8.75		\$11,025.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$2.25	\$0.00	\$2.25		\$2,835.00	
8. 365.00 SQ YD OF (255) FULL DEPTH PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND RIGID REPLACEMENT, CLASS MS, T=8", AS PER PLAN						
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$37.00	\$40.00	\$77.00		\$28,105.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$50.00	\$25.00	\$75.00		\$27,375.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.00	\$75.00	\$75.00		\$27,375.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$30.00	\$45.00	\$75.00		\$27,375.00	
9. 662.00 SQ YD OF (255) FULL DEPTH PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND RIGID REPLACEMENT, CLASS MS, T=8", JOINT REPLACEMENT,						
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$40.00	\$42.00	\$82.00		\$54,284.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$60.00	\$20.00	\$80.00		\$52,960.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.00	\$80.00	\$80.00		\$52,960.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$32.00	\$48.00	\$80.00		\$52,960.00	
10. 33.00 SQ YD OF (255) FULL DEPTH PAVEMENT REMOVAL AND RIGID REPLACEMENT, CLASS MS, T=10", AS PER PLAN						
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$40.00	\$47.00	\$87.00		\$2,871.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$65.00	\$20.00	\$85.00		\$2,805.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.00	\$85.00	\$85.00		\$2,805.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$34.00	\$51.00	\$85.00		\$2,805.00	
11. 3,437.00 GALLON OF (SPC) TACK COAT, TRACKLESS, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$1.00	\$4.00	\$5.00		\$17,185.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$0.50	\$3.50	\$4.00		\$13,748.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.64	\$4.11	\$4.75		\$16,325.75	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$1.30	\$1.95	\$3.25		\$11,170.25	
12. 21,557.00 SQ YD OF (422) SINGLE CHIP SEAL WITH POLYMER BINDER, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$1.00	\$1.15	\$2.15		\$46,347.55	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$0.25	\$1.50	\$1.75		\$37,724.75	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.00	\$1.90	\$1.90		\$40,958.30	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$0.76	\$1.13	\$1.89		\$40,742.73	

2012 Pavement Repair Program
 City of Willoughby
 Bid Opening Date: May 17, 2012
 Bid Tabulation Summary

Project No. 12135

LIST OF ALL ITEMS
 NOTE: Bidders Informal unit price or item total appear if different than bid tab calculated price.

Bidders	Labor	Material	Calculated Unit Price	Bidder's Informal Unit Price	Calculated Line Item Total	Bidder's Informal Line Item Total
13. 475.00 CU YD OF (448) ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, PG64-22, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$40.00	\$116.00	\$156.00		\$74,100.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$9.00	\$140.00	\$149.00		\$70,775.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$18.02	\$129.98	\$148.00		\$70,300.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$66.00	\$99.00	\$165.00		\$78,375.00	
14. 939.00 CU YD OF (448) ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 2, PG64-22, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$14.00	\$100.00	\$114.00		\$107,046.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$10.00	\$111.00	\$121.00		\$113,619.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$13.70	\$108.30	\$122.00		\$114,538.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$52.00	\$78.00	\$130.00		\$122,070.00	
15. 2,002.00 CU YD OF (448) ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, PG64-22, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$18.00	\$120.00	\$138.00		\$276,276.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$8.00	\$140.00	\$148.00		\$296,296.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$10.75	\$137.25	\$148.00		\$296,296.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$70.00	\$105.00	\$175.00		\$350,350.00	
16. 18,285.00 SQ YD OF (450) SPECIAL - PAVEMENT REINFORCING FABRIC - FIBERGLASS/POLYESTER HYBRID, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$1.10	\$4.00	\$5.10		\$93,253.50	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$0.40	\$4.60	\$5.00		\$91,425.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.00	\$5.00	\$5.00		\$91,425.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$2.00	\$3.00	\$5.00		\$91,425.00	
17. 39.00 EACH OF (604) INLET ADJUSTED TO GRADE, METHOD B.1., AS PER PLAN						
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$110.00	\$400.00	\$510.00		\$19,890.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$300.00	\$200.00	\$500.00		\$19,500.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.00	\$450.00	\$450.00		\$17,550.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$200.00	\$300.00	\$500.00		\$19,500.00	
18. 3.00 EACH OF (604) INLET FRAME AND GRATE, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$110.00	\$200.00	\$310.00		\$930.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$200.00	\$100.00	\$300.00		\$900.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.00	\$300.00	\$300.00		\$900.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$120.00	\$180.00	\$300.00		\$900.00	

2012 Pavement Repair Program
 City of Willoughby
 Bid Opening Date: May 17, 2012
 Bid Tabulation Summary

Project No. 12135

LIST OF ALL ITEMS
 NOTE: Bidders Informal unit price or item total appear if different than bid tab calculated price.

Bidders	Labor	Material	Calculated Unit Price	Bidder's Informal Unit Price	Calculated Line Item Total	Bidder's Informal Line Item Total
19. 12.00 EACH OF (604) MANHOLE FRAME AND COVER, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$80.00	\$200.00	\$280.00		\$3,360.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$170.00	\$100.00	\$270.00		\$3,240.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.00	\$270.00	\$270.00		\$3,240.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$108.00	\$162.00	\$270.00		\$3,240.00	
20. 76.00 EACH OF (604) MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE, METHOD B.1., AS PER PLAN						
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$110.00	\$350.00	\$460.00		\$34,960.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$300.00	\$150.00	\$450.00		\$34,200.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.00	\$400.00	\$400.00		\$30,400.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$160.00	\$240.00	\$400.00		\$30,400.00	
21. 700.00 FOOT OF (609) ASPHALT CONCRETE CURB, TYPE 2-B, METHOD A, INCLUDING REMOVAL, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$3.00	\$6.00	\$9.00		\$6,300.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$5.50	\$2.00	\$7.50		\$5,250.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$7.76	\$4.74	\$12.50		\$8,750.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$6.00	\$9.00	\$15.00		\$10,500.00	
22. 280.00 FOOT OF (609) COMBINATION CURB AND GUTTER, TYPE 4, INCLUDING REMOVAL, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$10.00	\$12.00	\$22.00		\$6,160.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$14.00	\$6.00	\$20.00		\$5,600.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.00	\$20.00	\$20.00		\$5,600.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$8.00	\$12.00	\$20.00		\$5,600.00	
23. 4,140.00 FOOT OF (609) CURB, TYPE 6, INCLUDING REMOVAL, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$8.00	\$9.00	\$17.00		\$70,380.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$11.00	\$5.00	\$16.00		\$66,240.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.00	\$16.00	\$16.00		\$66,240.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$6.40	\$9.60	\$16.00		\$66,240.00	
24. 1.00 LUMP OF (614) MAINTAINING TRAFFIC, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrín Valley Paving, Inc.	\$24,326.75	\$0.00	\$24,326.75		\$24,326.75	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$31,970.00	\$0.00	\$31,970.00		\$31,970.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$36,490.01	\$18,509.99	\$55,000.00		\$55,000.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$56,075.00	\$0.00	\$56,075.00		\$56,075.00	

2012 Pavement Repair Program
 City of Willoughby
 Bid Opening Date: May 17, 2012
 Bid Tabulation Summary

Project No. 12135

LIST OF ALL ITEMS
 NOTE: Bidders Informal unit price or item total appear if different than bid tab calculated price.

Bidders	Labor	Material	Calculated Unit Price	Bidder's Informal Unit Price	Calculated Line Item Total	Bidder's Informal Line Item Total
25. 6.00 EACH OF (638) VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE, INSTALLATION ONLY, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$110.00	\$200.00	\$310.00		\$1,860.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$200.00	\$100.00	\$300.00		\$1,800.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.00	\$300.00	\$300.00		\$1,800.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$120.00	\$180.00	\$300.00		\$1,800.00	
26. 41.00 EACH OF (638) VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE, RISER RING, AS PER PLAN						
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$5.00	\$45.00	\$50.00		\$2,050.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$30.00	\$70.00	\$100.00		\$4,100.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$10.87	\$29.13	\$40.00		\$1,640.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$40.00	\$60.00	\$100.00		\$4,100.00	
27. 0.76 MILE OF (642) EDGE LINE, TYPE 1						
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$1,000.00		\$760.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$800.00	\$400.00	\$1,200.00		\$912.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.00	\$1,200.00	\$1,200.00		\$912.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$480.00	\$720.00	\$1,200.00		\$912.00	
28. 0.83 MILE OF (642) CENTER LINE, TYPE 1						
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$1,000.00		\$830.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$1,280.00	\$300.00	\$1,580.00		\$1,311.40	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.00	\$1,580.00	\$1,580.00		\$1,311.40	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$632.00	\$948.00	\$1,580.00		\$1,311.40	
29. 101.00 FOOT OF (642) STOP LINE, TYPE 1						
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$2.00	\$3.00	\$5.00		\$505.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$4.00	\$3.00	\$7.00		\$707.00	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.00	\$7.00	\$7.00		\$707.00	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$2.80	\$4.20	\$7.00		\$707.00	
30. 158.00 FOOT OF (642) CROSSWALK LINE, TYPE 1						
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$2.00	\$3.00	\$5.00		\$790.00	
Ronyak Paving, Inc.	\$2.00	\$1.80	\$3.80		\$600.40	
Karvo Paving Co.	\$0.00	\$3.80	\$3.80		\$600.40	
Shelly Co. - Twinsburg Division	\$1.52	\$2.28	\$3.80		\$600.40	